

Literary Research

Year22, NO. 87

Spring 2025

 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.2634/Lire.22.87.9>

Analysis of Poets' Poetry Criticism

Yusuf Asghari Baygut¹

Received:10/3/2024 Accepted: 7/9/2024

Abstract

Examining the works of famous poets from the beginning to the 8th century, the current study answers the reason for poets' poetry criticism through descriptive-analytical method. The results revealed that some parts of the factors related to the poets' poetry criticism goes back to the essence of poetry itself; from this perspective, philosophical views should be taken into account. Another essential part of poets' poetry criticism is due to religious views. To explain this part, Qur'an and narrative texts should be taken into consideration. The function of poetry and the attitude of poets towards poetry are also other important factors. In some cases, perhaps this negative view of poetry and poets from the poets themselves can be considered a kind of literary tradition that has merely a theme-creating aspect. These results can be useful and noteworthy in literary studies and interdisciplinary research studies such as sociology of literature and psychology.

Keywords: *poets' poetry criticism, philosophy of poetry, sharia and poetry, function of poetry.*

¹ Corresponding author, Associate Professor of Persian Language and Literature, Jiroft University; y.asghari@ujiroft.ac.ir



Copyright © 2025, the Authors | Publishing Rights, ASPL This open-access article is published under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License which permits Share (copy and redistribute the material in any medium or format) and Adapt (remix, transform, and build upon the material) under the Attribution-NonCommercial terms

1. Introduction

Poetry in the Islamic world has grown and received significant attention in Arab and non-Arab countries so that a large part of Arab and non-Arab culture and knowledge should be found in the works of their poets when poets had the largest media base in society and nothing could be done without their serious presence; this would cause many people to turn to this group. However, it is surprising that many great poets expressed dissatisfaction with their profession and condemned poetry. This research answers the reason for this in a descriptive-analytical way via examining the works of famous poets from the very beginning to the 8th century. With a general view, it is possible to examine the basis of poets' poetry criticism under three main headings: "philosophical basis", "religious basis", and "functional basis" and show the reflection of each of these in the works of poets.

2. Philosophical basis

From the philosophical point of view, poetry "is an analogy that is prepared from imaginary events and does not cause any confirmation" (Avicenna, 1367: 523), and its foundation is simulation and imitation. From this point of view, "they do nothing but imitate ghosts and do not reach the truth" (Platoun, 2013: 564). On the other hand, imitation also leads to gossip (Homo, vol 4, p. 2019); these principles cause negative views on poetry. In Persian literature, Anuri Abivardi and Naser Khosro are among the most prominent poets whose poetry criticism is based on a philosophical perspective (Anvari, 1985: 407, 298, 297, 409, 456, 464; Naser Khosro, 2007: 93). One of the philosophical bases that has caused poets' poetry criticism is exaggeration. Inevitably, poetry has to show every impossible and fake thing in good clothes and use unnecessary exaggeration to such an extent that sometimes the poet suffers from abandoning Sharia etiquette from faith-related aspects". From this point of view, wrongness has no light and the work of poets is without light (Ibn Yamin, Bita: 447, 448) and poetry is not worthy of education (Nizami, 1985: 257).

3. Religious basis

Citing some verses of Quran (Ya-Sin, verse 69 and Sho'ara, verse 224) and some hadiths that have not agreed with poetry due to the incorrect function of poetry have become a reason for criticizing poetry by some poets (Khaqani, 1393: 10, 288; Naser Khosrow, 1386: 291). Sometimes, the skepticism of poets towards poetry is not directly derived from verses and hadiths, but some of these skepticisms can be

seen as related to the general concepts and religious ideas via reflection. Preference for learning religious concepts over poetry is one of these cases (Nizami Ganjavi, 1362: 239; Saadi, 1385: 942; Attar, 1368: 790, 440, 721; Sanai, 1388: 466, 658).

4. Functional basis

4.1 Praise and greed of poets

One of the main reasons for the reprehensibility of poetry is due to the exaggerated and false praises that can be seen in the poems of most poets due to worldly ambitions: "Poetry is a reprehensible slogan, and the poet is blamed at all circumstances and at all times since most poems are either about admiration or praising women, both of which are based on gross and outright lies" (Awfi, 1324: 11). Historical documents testify to the inconsistency of these praises with those praised. The praise of wicked and cruel people who, according to the holy sayings, make the throne of Allah tremble (Forozanfar, 1361: 4). To receive rewards and blessings, poets violated their self-respect and described themselves with expressions that are not worthy of a rhetorician (Kamaluddin Esfahani, 1348: 284, 551, 571; Anuri, 1364: 29, Masoud Saad, 1339: 109).

4.2 Sarcasm and satire

Sarcasm and the use of obscene words can be considered as one of the reasons for the reprehensibility of poetry, as in Greece, poets were also prohibited from using inappropriate content: "A poet should not include anything in his poems other than what according to the law is considered worthy, beautiful, and good." (Platoon, 1398: 2101, 4). However, sometimes poets make fun of the thief either because they did not receive a reward or because their poems were stolen (Kamaluddin Esfahani, 1348: 440; Suzani Samarqandi, 1338: 222).

4.3 The inability of poetry to express great thoughts and concepts

Poetry criticism on this basis, which is not very common, is often seen in the poems and speeches of mystics and mystic poets, especially in the works of Molavi. The Sufism has always presented the language as a barrier and prohibited (Shafi'i Kadkani, 2013: 256). According to this research, we can see the most poetry criticism in Molavi's works, and even other mystic poets have criticized poetry less for the so-called reason (Molavi, 1400: 58, 61, 261, 304, 315, 416, 1388, 70, 79, 138, 824; Sanai, 1388: 114, 115; Fakhreddin Iraqi, 1375: 342; Attar, 1368: 319).

4.4 Depression of poetry

Sometimes, poets make a complaint of poetry because of the praised who did not give their poetry its due value (kamaladin Esfehani, 1348: 223; Jamaladin Esfehani, 1320: 150). Sometimes, they also made a complaint of the time, not acting generously and being incompatible with them; "what a pity that art is a source of suffering" (Masoud Saad, 1339: 59). This kind of poetry criticism is prevalent among poets and rhetoricians that can be considered a kind of "literary tradition" besides telling the truth

4. Results

Based on this research, the basis of poetry criticism can be examined in three main axes; some parts of the poets' poetry criticism has a philosophical basis. The provision of poetry from imaginary cases and its imitation not causing any kind of truthiness and appearing in the form of contradiction, exaggeration, and lies in poetry are based on philosophical thought. Praising wisdom and philosophy and criticizing poetry is a reflection of this philosophical view. The influence of some religious ideas and concepts, such as some verses and hadiths mentioned in the condemnation of some poems and poets, is another basis for criticizing poetry. Accordingly, Poets have always considered poetry to be insignificant and worthless compared to Shari'a for the sake of politeness or devotion and belief and have considered being entertained with it a waste of life. The other source and basis of censoring poetry should be considered as related to the function of poetry and the behavior of poets themselves. Praise, sarcasm, humor, and greed of poets, depression in poetry, the existence of pretentious and incompetent poets, and the limitations of poetry for meanings and thoughts are among the factors bringing about this kind of pessimism towards poetry.

References

Quran

Nahj ol-Balaghah; (2004) Sobhi al-Saleh, al-Tabbah IV, Al-Qaira: Dar al-Kitab al-Masri, Beirut: Dar al-Kitab al-Lebanani.

Abbas Qomi; (1985) Safin al-Bihar; vol. 4, vol. 5, Qom: Aswah.

Abdul-Wase Jabali; (2007) Divan; edited by Zabihullah Safa, vol. 2, Tehran: Amir Kabir.

Amini, Abdul-Hosseini; (2004) Al-Ghadir fi al-Kitab wa al-Sunnah wa al-Adab; Vol. 2, Vol. 7, Tehran: Dar al-Kitab al-Islamiyya.

- Amoli, Shams al-Din Muhammad ibn Mahmud; (2010) *Nafays al-Funun fi Arays al-Ayoun*, vol. 3, Tehran: Islamia Publications.
- Anwari, Ali ibn Muhammad; (1985) *Divan*; Edited by Saeed Nafisi, Vol. 3, Tehran: Sekhe Pirouz Publications.
- Aristotle; (1964) *Fan shar*; translated by Abdol-Hossein Zarrinkoob, vol. 2, Tehran: Book Translation and Publishing Company.
- Athir al-Din Aksikti; (1958) *Diwan*; edited by Rukn al-Din Homayoun Farrukh, Tehran: Rudaki Bookstore.
- Attar Neyshaburi, Farid al-Din; (2007) *Masab-e-Nameh*; edited by Mohammad Reza Shafi'i Kadkani, Vol. 3, Tehran: Sokhan.
- Attar Neyshaburi, Farid al-Din; (2010) *Mantiq al-Tayr*; edited by Mohammad Reza Shafi'i Kadkani, Vol. 10, Tehran: Sokhan.
- Attar Neyshaburi, Farid al-Din; (1987) *Asrarname*; edited by Mohammad Reza Shafi'i Kadkani, Tehran: Sokhan.
- Attar Neyshaburi, Farid al-Din; (1989) *Divan attar*; Edited by Taghi Tafazzli, Vol. 5, Tehran: Scientific and Cultural.
- Aufi, Mohammad; (1945) *Labab al-Lab*; edited by Edward Brown, Leiden.
- Avicenna, Hussein ibn Abdullah; (1988) *Isharat va Tanbihat* (vol. 2: Logic); translated by Hassan Malekshahi, Tehran: Soroush.
- Ayn al-Qudah al-Hamadani; (1962) *Tamhidat*; edited by Afif Asiran, Tehran: University of Tehran.
- Azad Belgrami, Gholam-Ali; (1271 AH) *Ameera Treasury*; a bomb
- Bukhari, Muhammad ibn Ismail; (Bita) *Sahih al-Bukhari*; Haqqeh Usula Taha Abd al-Rauf Saad, Cairo: Al-Muktabeh al-Iman, Beita.
- Dehkhoda, Ali Akbar; (1995) *Proverbs and Judgment*; vol. 3, vol. 8, Tehran: Amir Kabir.
- Dehkhoda, Ali Akbar; (1998) *Dictionary*; Tehran: University of Tehran.
- Faryabi ,Zahir; (1982) *Divan*; edited by Amir Hossein Yazgerdi, edited by Asghar Dadbeh, Tehran: Qatra Publishing.
- Foruzanfar, Badi'-ul-Zaman; (1982) *Hadiths of the Mathnawi*; Third volume, Tehran: Amir Kabir.
- Foruzanfar, Badi'-ul-Zaman; (2008) *Sokhan va Sukhwaran*; Tehran: Zavar.
- Garkani, Mohammad Hossein; (1998) *Abdi'-ul-Bada'i*; Edited by Hossein Ja'fari, Tabriz: Ahrar.

- Ghazali, Mohammad ibn Mohammad; (2013) *Ihya' al-Ulum al-Din*; Vol. 2 (Quarter of Habits), translated by Moayyid al-Din Mohammad al-Khwarizmi, edited by Hossein Khadiyy Jam, Vol. 8, Tehran: Scientific and Cultural Publications.
- Ibn Majah, Muhammad ibn Yazid; (1998) *Sunan Ibn Majah*; vol. 2, Haqq al-Usool Khalil Ma'mun Shiha, Beirut: Dar al-Murafa.
- Ibn Yamin Fariyami; (beta) *Diwan al-Sha'ar*; edited by Hossein Ali Bastani Rad, Tehran: Sana'i.
- Iraqi, Fakhr al-Din Ibrahim; (1996) *Kulyat al-Iraqi*; edited and introduced by Saeed Nafisi, vol. 8, Tehran: Sanaei.
- Jamal al-Din Isfahani, Muhammad ibn Abd al-Razzaq; (1941) *Diwan*; edited by Hassan Wahid Dastgerdi, Beita.
- Kamal-al-Din Isfahani, Isma'il; (1969) *Divan*; Edited by Hossein Bahr al-Oloumi, Tehran: Dekhoda.
- Kasa'i Marozi; (1985) *Poems of Hakim Kasa'i Marozi and a Study of His Life and Works*; Mehdi Derakhshan, Tehran: University of Tehran.
- Kashani, Mulla Fath-Allah; (1995) *Tafsir Manhaj al-Sadiqin*; Corrected by Abul-Hasan Sha'arai, Tehran: Islamiyya Bookstore.
- Khajoo Kermani, Kamal al-Din; (1990) *Diwan of Poems*; Edited by Ahmad Soheili Khansari, vol. 2, Tehran: Pazheng.
- Khanlodi, Shir Ali; (1998) *Tazkireh Mira' al-Khayal*; edited by Hamid Hassani and in collaboration with Behrouz Safarzadeh, Tehran: Rozaneh.
- Khaqani, Afzal al-Din; (2009) *Diwan*; edited by Zia al-Din Sajjadi, ninth volume, Tehran: Zovar.
- Khaqani, Afzal al-Din; (2537) *Tohfe' al-Iraqueen*; edited by Yahya Gharib, second volume, Tehran: Pocket Books Joint Stock Company.
- Kulani, Muhammad ibn Ya'qub; (2007) *Al-Kafi*; Volume 1, Beirut: Manshurat al-Fajr.
- Makarem Shirazi, Nasser and a group of writers; (1992) *Tafsir Nimno*; vol. 18, vol. 10, Tehran: Dar al-Kuttab al-Islamiyya.
- Manouchehri Damghani; (1959) *Divan*; edited by Mohammad Dabirsiyaghi, vol. 2, Tehran: Zavar.
- Masoud Saad Salman; (1950) *Divan*; edited by Rashid Yasemi, Tehran: Pirouz Publications.

- Moezzi, Mohammad bin Abdul Malik Neyshaburi; (1959) *Divan*; edited by Abbas Iqbal, Tehran: Islamiyya Bookstore.
- Nasser Khosrow; *Divan of Poems*; (2007) edited by Nasrollah Taghavi, with introduction and comments by Taghizadeh, Dehkhoda and Minovi, Tehran: Mythology.
- Nezami Ganjavi, Elias-Ben-Yusuf; (1983) *Divan Qasayid and Ghazaliyat*; edited by Saeed Nafisi, vol. 5, Tehran: Foroughi.
- Nezami Ganjavi, Elias-Ben-Yusuf; (1993) *Makhzan-e-Asrar*; edited by Hassan Vahid Dastgerdi, with the help of Saeed Hamidian, vol. 15, Tehran: Qatra Publishing.
- Ohadi Maraghi; (1961) *Kulyat (Divan, Mantiq al-Ishaq, Jam Jam)*; Edited by Saeed Nafisi, Tehran: Amir Kabir.
- Plato; (2004) *The Emperor*; Translated by Fuad Rouhani, Vol. 9, Tehran: Elmi va Farhangi, 1383.
- Plato; (2019) *The Works of Plato*; Vol. 4, translated by Mohammad Hassan Lotfi and Reza Kaviani, Vol. 4, Tehran: Al-Khwarizmi.
- Rashid al-Din Vatawat; (1990) *Divan*; edited by Saeed Nafisi, Tehran: Barani Library.
- Rumi, Jalal al-Din Muhammad; (1990) *Fiyyah Ma Fiyyah*; edited by Badi' al-Zaman Foruzanfar, vol. 13, Tehran: Amir Kabir.
- Rumi, Jalal al-Din Muhammad; (1999) *Kuliyat Shams*; edited by Badi' al-Zaman Foruzanfar, fourth edition, Tehran: Hermes.
- Rumi, Jalal-ud-Din Mohammad; (2009) *Masnavi Manawi*; 3 vols., edited by Reynold Nicholson, 9th edition, Tehran: Qoghnoos.
- Saadi, Mosleh ibn Abdullah; (1985) *Saadi's Generalities*; edited by Mohammad Ali Foroughi, Tehran: Hermes.
- Salman Savji; (1992) *Divan*; edited by Abolghasem Halat, Tehran: Selseleh Jasharul Ma.
- Sana'i, Majdood ibn Adam; (1990) *Hadiqah al-Haqiqah and Shariah al-Tariqah*; edited by Modarres Razavi, Tehran: Sepehr Press.
- Sana'i, Majdood ibn Adam; (1999) *Divan*; Edited by Mohammad Taqi Modarres Razavi, Vol. 7, Tehran: Sana'i.
- Seif Farghani; (1985) *Divan*; edited by Zabihullah Safa, Vol. 2, Tehran: Ferdowsi.
- Shafi'i Kadkani, Mohammad Reza; (1993) *Language of Poetry in Sufi Prose*; Vol. 5, Tehran: Sokhan.

- Shafi'i, Mohammad Ibn Idris; (1990) *Divan al-Imam al-Shafi'i; Jama'ah and Sharrah of Mohammad Abd al-Rahim*, Beirut: Dar al-Fikr.
- Sozani Samarqandi; (1959) *Divan*; edited by Naser al-Din Shah Hosseini, Tehran: Amir Kabir.
- Tabataba'i, Mohammad Hossein; (1995) *Tafsir al-Mizan*; translated by Mohammad Baqir Mousavi, Vol. 15, Vol. 5, Qom: Islamic Publications.
- Tayyib, Abdul-Hosseini; (1980) *Atib al-Bayan fi Tafsir al-Quran*; vol. 10, vol. 2, Tehran: Islam Publications.
- Tirmidhi, Muhammad ibn Ismail; (Beita) *Sunan al-Tirmidhi*; Beirut: Dar Ihyaa Turat al-Arabi, Beita.
- Tusi, Khawaja Nasir; (Bita) *Basis of Quotation*; edited by Modarres Razavi, Vol. 3, Tehran: University of Tehran.
- Vazin-Pour, Nader; (1995) *Praise of the Infamy of Persian Literature*; Tehran: Moein.